Members would have an opportunity to seek clarifications. Therefore, I seek your indulgence in postponing the statement.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): I agree with you. But the conventions are basically meant to help us and not to overpower us. Let the Minister make his statement. We shall sit 15 minutes more and then you can seek your clarifications.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, let the hon. Minister make the statement. We can seek clarifications tomorrow. The Minister is ready with the statement. There have been a number of occasions when we have sought clarifications later on. I do not know what is the content of the statement. There may not be any clarifications at all. If there are any clarifications, we can seek clarifications later on.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): I think Dr. Joshi has no objection. Yes, Dr. Joshi.

5.00 P.M.

STATEMENT BY MINISTER

Award of Swarnajayanti Fellowships for the Year 1999-2000

मानव संसाधन विकास और विज्ञान तथा प्रौद्योगिकी मंत्री (डा॰ मुरली मनोहर जोशी): मैं युवा वैज्ञानिकों के लिए स्वर्ण जयंती फैलोशिप्स पर उनके परिणाम की सूचना सदन को देना चाहता हूं।

हमारी सभ्यता की परंपरायें सदैव ही तात्पर्य एवं सत्य में वैज्ञानिक जांच के सर्वोच्च महत्व से जुड़ी रही है। इस समृद्ध परंपरा के प्रति हार्दिक सम्मान के रूप में सरकार द्वारा हमारी स्वतंत्रता की 50वीं वर्षगांठ के अवसर पर स्वर्ण जयन्ती फैलोशिप स्कीम का शुभारंभ किया गया था। इसका उद्देश्य युवा वैज्ञानिकों को विज्ञान एवं प्रौद्योगिकी के अग्रणी क्षेत्रों में बुनियादी अनुसंधान शुरू करने हेतु प्रोत्साहित करना तथा उत्कृष्टता के मानक प्राप्त करना है, जो विश्व में सर्वोत्तम के साथ स्पर्धा कर सके।

30-40 वर्ष की आयु वर्ग के उत्कृष्ट भारतीय युवा वैज्ञानिक जिनका ट्रैक रिकार्ड प्रमाणित हो चुका हो, इन फैलोशिप के लिए पात्र हैं। चुने गए उम्मीदवारों को प्रतिमाह 25,000/- रुपये की फैलोशिप की आकर्षक राशि दी जाती है तथा उन्हें विज्ञान इंजीनियरी अथवा औषधि के अग्रणी क्षेत्रों में अनुसंधान के एक कार्यक्रम के लिए अधिकतम 5 वर्षों की अवधि के लिए सहयोग दिया जाता है। इस परियोजना के तहत दिए जाने वाले सहयोग में उपस्कर, मानवशक्ति, आकस्मिकताएं, उपभोज्य, अन्तरराष्ट्रीय यात्रा सहित यात्रा तथा प्रशासनिक एवं बुनियादी सुविधाएं शामिल हैं।

इस कार्यक्रम को देश तथा विदेशों के वैज्ञानिकों के बीच व्यापक रूप से प्रचारित किया गया है। आवेदन पत्रों की जांच हेतु एक सुदृढ़ प्रक्रिया अपनाई गई है। इसमें 6 विषय क्षेत्रों, नामतः जीवविज्ञान, रसायनिक विज्ञान, भौतिक विज्ञान, इंजीनियरी विज्ञान, गणितीय विज्ञान एवं भू एवं वायुमंडलीय विज्ञान में विशेषज्ञ समिति, एक स्वर्ण जयन्ती फैलोशिप के लिए उम्मीदवार के चयन की पूरी प्रक्रिया अब पूरी हो गई

है तथा मुझे सभा पटल पर स्वर्ण जयन्ती फैलोशिप के लिए चुने गए छः युवा वैज्ञानिकों के नामों की घोषणा करते हुए अत्यधिक प्रसन्नता हो रही है। वे उम्मीदवार हैं:—

1. डा० देवज्योति चौधरी, मेहता रिसर्च इन्स्टीच्यूट आफ मेथेमेटिक्स एंड मेथेमेटिकल फिजिक्स, इलाहाबाद
2. डा० डी० प्रसाद, मेहता रिसर्च इन्स्टीच्यूट आफ मेथेमेटिक्स एंड मेथेमेटिकल फिजिक्स, इलाहाबाद
3. डा० वी० वी० रानाडे, राष्ट्रीय रसायन प्रयोगशाला, पुणे
4. डा० एन० कुमार सिवराजन, भारतीय विज्ञान संस्थान, बंगलौर
5. डा० एस० उमापति, भारतीय विज्ञान संस्थान बंगलौर
6. डा० आर० वरदराजन, भारतीय विज्ञान संस्थान, बंगलौर

स्वर्ण जयन्ती फैलोशिप पाने के लिए मैं इन सभी युवा वैज्ञानिकों को बधाई देना चाहूंगा तथा आने वाले वर्षों में युवा वैज्ञानिकों के लिए स्वर्ण जयन्ती फैलोशिप के लिए इस प्रयास के समर्थन हेतु इस सदन का सहयोग चाहूंगा, ताकि और अधिक युवा वैज्ञानिक इस कार्यक्रम में भाग ले सकें तथा भारतीय विज्ञान को अन्तरराष्ट्रीय स्तर का स्पर्धात्मक बनाने में सहयोग कर सकें। मैं चाहूंगा कि सदन इन वैज्ञानिकों को प्रभावित करे। यह परम्परा हमने गत वर्ष से डाली थी। यह हमारे देश की सबसे महत्वपूर्ण योजना है। वैज्ञानिकों की तरफ से पूरे सदन को सूचना देना, यह हमने पिछले साल परम्परा डाली है, उसी के अनुसार हम समझते हैं कि किसी कन्वर्सेशन की जरूरत नहीं पड़ी।

राष्ट्रीय कोर समिति तथा सचिवों की एक अधिकार प्रदत्त समिति शामिल है।

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (West Bengal): I join the Minister in congratulating the young scientists and we do appreciate their work. I hope that they will contribute, in future, to the development of science in this country.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): In spite of your feeling that no clarifications would be required, Sarla Maheswariji wants to seek clarification.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): I have also given my name for clarifications.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): You can fix up a time for tomorrow.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Tomorrow, I am going to attend the UNESCO Conference. So, we will have the clarifications just now.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): Since Dr. Joshi will not be available tomorrow,—he will be out of country—we will have the clarifications just now. But be precise about the clarifications that you are seeking. श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी।

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी (पश्चिमी बंगाल): धन्यवाद महोदय, मैं मंत्री महोदय को बधाई देना चाहूंगी इस योजना की शुरुआत के लिए साथ ही साथ मेरी कुछ आशंकाएं हैं, विशेषकर पिछले 18 महीनों का जो हमारा अनुभव रहा, उस अनुभव की रोशनी में, जोशी जी हंस रहे हैं लेकिन यह कड़वी हकीकत है, जिसका न सिर्फ हमारे देश के वैज्ञानिकों ने, बल्कि हमारे देश के तमाम उच्चतम शोध संस्थान ने, वे विज्ञान की संस्थाएं थीं, इतिहास की संस्थाएं थीं, उन तमाम संस्थाओं ने सरकार के सांप्रदायिक रुझान का, और एक ऐसे रुझान का जिसके चलते हमारे विज्ञान के सत्यपरकशोध को हानि होती है। इसलिए मैं मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहूंगी कि अब जो विज्ञान के नाम पर और उच्चता हासिल करने के लिए, विशेष योग्यता हासिल करने के लिए जो फेलोशिप दे रहे हैं, उसमें क्या इस बात को नजर रख रहे हैं कि ऐसे वैज्ञनिकों को प्रोत्साहन देने का पक्षपातरहित तरीका अपनाया जाए ताकि हमारे वैज्ञानिक आगे आ सकें? मैं मंत्री महोदय से जानना चाहूंगी कि कल राष्ट्रपति महोदय का जो अभिभाषण आया, जिसके जरिये सरकार की नीतियों का इजहार हुआ, उस अभिभाषण में एक तरफ उच्च शिक्षा का आप पूरी तरह से प्राइवेटाईजेशन करने की बात करते हैं, उसका निजीकरण करने की बात करते हैं। एक तरफ आप निजीकरण करके उच्च शिक्षा को अभिजात्य वर्ग के लिए सीमित कर देंगे तो इस में क्या यह संभव होगा कि हमारा देश जो मानव संसाधन के क्षेत्र में इतनी बड़ी क्षमता रखता है आप सही रूप में अपने इस मानव संसाधनों का इस्तेमाल कर पायेंगे? क्या सही रूप में हमारे अपने देश की जो वैज्ञानिक क्षमता है उस वैज्ञानिक क्षमता का हम सही उपयोग कर पायेंगे? उनकी जो योग्यता है उस योग्यता का सही उपयोग ऐसी स्थिति में नहीं हो पाएगा। इसलिए मैं यह निवेदन करना चाहती हूं कि ये जो तमाम संस्थायें हैं इनमें हमारे कोई निजी राजनैतिक स्वार्थ आड़े नहीं आने चाहिए, इनमें साम्प्रदायिक रुझान के लोगों को नहीं आने देना चाहिए, जो कि हमारे देश की परम्परा है। इसलिए मंत्री महोदय से मेरा निवेदन है कि वे कृपया यह बतायें कि आपने वैज्ञानिकों की जो कमेटी बनाई है उसके लिए आपने क्या आधार निश्चित किया है? आपने जो कमेटी बनाई है उस कमेटी की सदस्यता क्या है, इन तमाम चीजों पर अगर आप रोशनी डालें तो यह बहुत अच्छा होगा।

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI (Kerala): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I join the hon. Minister as well as our leader, Shri Pranab Mukherjee, in congratulating the scientists who have been awarded these fellowships. At the same time, I hope the Minister will agree that there has to be transparency in the process of such selections. At the moment, I am not attributing any motive. But it is necessary because our country is a vast country and we have to give opportunities to all the scientists who think they are eligible to apply for such fellowships. It is necessary for this House to be informed as to what this scheme is, what procedure has been adopted, which are the persons on the selection committee. These are important matters which should be known not only to Parliament, but to the people also. Then only the credibility of such fellowships and the transparency in the whole procedure can be accepted by the people. So, I wish to know what the scheme is totality is and what procedure has been adopted. You may place the details on the Table. But at the moment, you can let us know who the members of the selection

committee are, what the procedure is and what the total number of applications received from India and abroad is.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I am unable to associate myself with the announcement that has been made by the Minister. I am sorry I may appear to be odd because the Minister is expecting some compliments. My main grouse is that you have shut the door for certain people. You have shut the door for them once and for all. From the scientific institutions and in the super-speciality courses, you have removed the 25% population of this country. The Scheduled Castes have no place. The Scheduled Tribes have no place. You are giving these fellowships only to some, denying the same to 25% people of this country. So, I am unable to associate myself with this, unless every citizen of this country is treated equally and equal opportunities are given to him and he is allowed to complete for these fellowships. On the one side, we have these super-speciality courses for which there are no reservations. On the other, in the scientific institutions, even in the case of laboratory attendants, there are no reservations. And we call them scientific institutions! This is the scientific advancement! These are the scientific fellowships that you are giving!

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): What is the clarification that you are seeking?

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I am seeking the clarification. Why have you shut the doors to the 25% population of this country? Why do only some people enjoy this and the others do not? Why can't you treat them on par with others? Why can't you remove this bar, so far as these scientific institutions and the super-speciality courses are concerned, and make them also eligible to study and get these fellowships? This is my question.

SHRI BRATIN SENGUPTA (West Bengal): I want to ask a question regarding industrial R&D. There is a report that the number of IIT pass-outs going abroad—the phenomenon of brain-drain—is slightly on the decline. But the fact is that it is because of something else. It is not that they have become more akin to the Indian realities. But it is because of the fact that certain multinational companies have opened their counters inside the IIT campuses. May I request the Minister to see that more attractive proposals are put to the IIT pass-outs in particular so that the brain-drain can be checked in a positive direction, not in the direction in which it is being done now.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Sir, the Swaranjayanti Fellowships were...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): Dr. Joshi, we have a new Member—Dr. Mahanta. She wants to speak for the first time, and seek clarifications. Could you give us two minutes? Dr. Mahanta, please.

DR. (SMT.) JOYASREE GOSWAMI MAHANTA (Assam): Sir, first of all, I want to congratulate the Government, especially Dr. Joshi, for introducing these scholarships for young scientists. Being a person of scientific background, I feel that it would be very much inspiring to have these fellowships for the scientists. I hope that other streams of science would also be introduced in such fellowships. I hope the junior scientists below the age of 30 years *i.e.* from 22 yrs to 30 yrs also would render their services under such fellowships in separate group in future, under this Government, and specially, under the leadership of Dr. Joshi.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Sir, the Swaranjayanti Fellowships were constituted in the year 1997 by the then Government of India, and the guidelines were published then, and we are following the same guidelines There is no change in those guidelines, and if the hon. Chairman permits me, I can lay those guidelines on the Table of the House. These are available in the Library also. I will authenticate it.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Yes, yes.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: As I said, it is with regard to the selection of candidates for the award of Swaranjayanti Fellowships for the year 1998-99. The Swaranjayanti Fellowships Scheme was launched on August 15, 1997 when I was not the Minister, nor this Government was in the office to give an impetus to basic research in science and technology in the country. During the year, 11 scientists were awarded these fellowships. The awards were given by the hon. Prime Minister to the scientists, and the award ceremony was held on 27th October, 1998. This scheme was continued during the current year as well. Efforts were made to widely publicise the scheme within as well as outside the country. The advertisement was inserted in all the national and local newspapers on August 15, 1998. It was also inserted in the current Science and University News. It was also sent to select Indian Missions abroad. As a result of this exercise, a total number of 285 applications were received. The break up of applications received is given below:

Life Sciences — 105; Engineering Sciences — 73; Physical Sciences — 35; Chemical Sciences — 32; Earth and Atmospheric Sciences — 27 and Mathematical Sciences — 13.

As per the procedure established last year, six expert committees in six disciplines, namely, engineering, life, physical, chemical, earth and atmospheric sciences and mathematics were constituted. A National Core Committee was also constituted under the chairmanship of Prof. M. M. Sharma, former Director, UDCC, Mumbai University, Mumbai. Each expert committee met twice, except the committee on mathematics which met only once. The first meeting of these committees was held broadly to screen the

applications. After detailed discussions and deliberations, the committee decided to invite all the 41 candidates for making presentations in the next expert committee. A long and short list, including the candidates selected by the different committees can be seen. In the second meeting, candidates made a presentation for a period of 20 minutes each, followed by discussions for 10 to 15 minutes. They were then short-listed. Now, a comparative statement including the scientists shortlisted is like this:

Life sciences, number of applicants is 105, first meeting — 7, second meeting of shortlisting — 28; Engineering — 73, first meeting — 13, second meeting — 6; Physics — number of applications — 35, first meeting — 8, second meeting — 2; Chemistry — number of applications — 32, first meeting — 7, second meeting — 3; Earth and atmospheric sciences — number of applications — 27, first meeting — 5, second meeting — nil; Mathematics — 13, first meeting 1, second meeting 1.

A meeting of National Core Committee was held on July 5, 1999. In this meeting, 14 candidates from all the disciplines were invited to make a presentation. There were 3 from chemical sciences, two from physical sciences and two from life sciences, one from mathematics. No candidate was shortlisted in the area of earth and atmospheric sciences. Candidates made a presentation for a period of ten minutes; each followed by a discussion for five to ten minutes; and, after a detailed discussion, six candidates, which I have announced, were found qualified.

The National Core Committee of Experts was headed by Prof. M.M. Sharma, Chairman, Ex-Director, UDCT, 500, 'Saurav', Plot No. 39, Svastik Park, Chembur, Bombay; Prof. S.K. Joshi, Ex-Director General, CSIR; Prof. R. Narasimhan, National Institute of Advanced Studies, Bangalore; Dr. M. Vidya Sagar, Member, Director, Centre for Artificial Intelligence and Robotics, Raj Bhavan Circle, Bangalore; Prof. G. Govil, Member, Tata Institute of Fundamental Research, Homi Bhabha Road, Colaba, Bombay; Prof. G.S. Agarwal, Director, Physical Research Laboratory, Navrangpura, Ahmedabad; Prof. S.P. Sukhatme, Director and Professor, Indian Institute of Technology, Powai, Bombay; Prof. G. Venkat, Director, Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore; Prof. B.L. Dikshitalu, Director, Centre for Space Science and Technology and Education in Asia and Pacific Region, IRS Campus, Dehradun; Prof. M.S. Raghavan, Professor of Eminence, Tata Institute of Fundamental Research, Homi Bhabha Road, Bombay.

All these scientists are know internationally and the scientists are recognised all over the world. Now, I will give you the list of the Selection Committee members from various subjects. That is also available with me. *(Interruptions)* Let there be transparency. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): If the hon. Minister addresses the query raised by Mr. Hanumanthappa, it would be better. When was the door shut? Was it shut during his regime or... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): I am confident that he finds the door very much open. *(Interruptions)*

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: It is open. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Mr. Naidu always misinterprets things. *(Interruptions)* The Minister does not know that the door is closed. You have abolished reservation in super-speciality subjects ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Just wait. *(Interruptions)* Bear with me. *(Interruptions)* The Supreme Court defined... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I know. *(Interruptions)* The matter is pending before the Government. *(Interruptions)*

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: These subjects are not known as super-speciality subjects. You must first understand the meaning of super-speciality subjects, Mr. Hanumanthappa.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I know how your departments have been interpreting these. I know *(Interruptions)*

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Super-speciality subjects are well defined in terms of scientific terminology all over the world. These subjects are not known... *(Interruptions)*... These persons are not working in the field. Please bear with me. We are following the guidelines which were issued in 1997 and no door has been shut. We do not intend to shut any door for any scientist. The only thing is that they must... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Do you know how many of them belong to these? Out of the 200 odd who have been selected, do you know how many belong to these categories? *(Interruptions)* I am deliberately not putting the questions because I know the truth. That is why I have not put questions. *(Interruptions)* Let us know the details now.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: You see, the list of experts which I have read... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I am not talking of experts.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: You see, they are experts... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I know who they are...*(Interruptions)*

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: No, No, Mr. Hanumanthappa, please do not say like this...*(Interruptions)*... You are casting aspersions on the most

respected and reputed scientists of this country and those who are...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I am not casting aspersions on them. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Yes, you are casting aspersions when you say...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: No. ...*(Interruptions)*...I want to know about the list of applicants...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: I can give you the list of applicants. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I want to know how many of them are from this caste...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: It is not a question of...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: You say...*(Interruptions)*.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: No, ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK S. SHIRODKAR): Dr. Joshi, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... If there are guidelines given and following the guidelines certain invitations or certain applications have been made, no matter from where they have come or from which strata they have come, it is not the function of the Government. Let us not go into something which is unpleasant; which has begun in a very pleasant manner. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I most respectfully submit that the Chair should not speak for the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK S. SHIRODKAR): I am not speaking for the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I do not want any one to speak for the Government from the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): I am not speaking for the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Mr. Hanumanthappa, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... I request with folded hands; do not introduce these considerations in a place, in a section, which has given India a very top name in the field of science and technology. It is something which is of a vital importance. Please do not demoralise these scientists. Do not create any such thing by which such a great thing which we are doing, which we are pursuing in this country, gets involved in a sort of controversy. I thought it would be wise to come to the House to inform the hon. Members about the

achievement of the Indian scientists. It is an occasion when we sould praise these persons. These are not persons who in future will earn FRS and Nobel prizes. Our attempt is to create conditions in India so that our scientists are qualified to become FRS and earn Nobel prizes. This is a humble and modest attempt in that direction. It was instituted in 1997 on the 50th Anniversary of our Independence. We thought that it is desirable to continue this practice. This is a very healthy thing, a very encouraging thing. We have also introduced new awards in the field of biotechnology. In the field of technology, there is a fresh is a fresh award for technology. There is a fresh award for biotechnology. More awards are being announced. We want to give full opportunities to the Indian scientists in order to encourage them. I assure you that no allurement will take them away from India. These are the conditions which we want to create. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I have only one point for clarification. ...*(Interruptions)*... I want scientific advancement*(Interruptions)* Just a moment...*(Interruptions)*... My point was that certain categories of people do not have access to these things. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not showing any disrespect to our scientists. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK S. SHIRODKAR): Thank you, Mr. Hanumanthappa. Dr. Joshi, we thank you. I am confident that this House congratulates you and hopes that in future your task in selecting the scientists becomes more and more difficult. The House stands adjourned till 11.00 A.M. tomorrow.

The House then adjourned at twenty-three minutes past five of the clock till eleven of the clock on Wednesday, the 27th October, 1999.